

Generation One

1. Nathaniel⁷ Tuthill, born 19 May 1790² at Wading River, Town of Riverhead, Suffolk County;³ died 13 May 1852 at Greenport, Town of Southold, Suffolk County.⁴ He married on 21 February 1816, Clarissa Miller,⁵ daughter of Nathaniel and Martha (née Miller) Miller. Clarissa was born 26 September 1794 at Miller Place, Town of Brookhaven, Suffolk County;⁶ died 18 May 1855 at Greenport.⁷

Nathaniel and Clarissa grew up in villages on Long Island's north shore—Nathaniel in a household of farmers and sailors,⁸ and Clarissa in the home of her maternal grandmother.⁹ Clarissa's parents died of yellow fever when she was four years old.¹⁰

After his 1816 marriage, Nathaniel commanded coastal sailing vessels. On six- to eight-month trips, he sailed from New York City down the Atlantic coast to Georgia, the Carolinas, and the West Indies, transporting Yankee notions, corn, cotton, turpentine, rum, and molasses. On an 1820 voyage, his crew fought "a severe squall attended with hard Rane . . . sharp lightning & thunder," stood firm when it blew so hard that the captain "thot dangor of blowing the Trysale out of the Rope,"¹¹ and recovered quickly when "the sea broke over the deck and damaged the boat." Once, as the vessel came about, the main sheet parted and "the boom took comand of the deck" until quick action of the crew "soon conkered it."¹²

2. Nathaniel Tuthill Family Bible, *The Holy Bible: Containing the Old and New Testaments* (New York: Evert Duyckinck and others, 1813), Wading River Historical Society, Wading River, N.Y. According to Gwen Campbell, ed., *Descendants of Henry Tuthill 1612-1650* (Keno, Oreg.: Solo Press, 1991), Nathaniel was a seventh generation descendant of Henry¹ Tuthill.

3. Nathaniel Tuthill obituary, undated clipping from unidentified newspaper in "George M. Tuthill Diaries," 12 volumes, 1847-1865, 3: 399, Bentley Historical Library, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor. (The author thanks Hildy Cummings of Storrs, Conn., for transcriptions from the diary and Mary Lou Barry of Ann Arbor, Mich., for reading and photocopying numerous pages.)

4. "George M. Tuthill Diaries," 3: 398.

5. Nathaniel Tuthill Family Bible.

6. "The Age of Nathaniel Miller and his wife and eight Children," 1798; in possession of author. The document, dated 29 May, is in Nathaniel Miller's handwriting.

7. "George M. Tuthill Diaries," 3: 599.

8. Osborn Shaw, "Wading River," in *Historical Sketches of Settlements and Villages of North Brookhaven Town 1655-1955* (Bellport, N.Y.: U.S. Press, 1955), 87; and Elisabeth S. Lapham *Echoes From the Past* (Wading River, N.Y.: Community Journal, 1989), 40.

9. Martha Helme Miller reported Clarissa's presence in her maternal grandmother's home after the death of Clarissa's parents. See "Martha Helme Miller's Notebook," 1912; in possession of Margaret Davis Gass, Miller Place, N.Y. (2000). Receipts from Nathaniel Miller's estate that record payments for boarding and educating Clarissa corroborate this; original receipts in possession of author.

10. Timothy Miller Family Bible, *The Book of Common Prayer* (Oxford: Wright and W. Gill, 1770); in possession of the author. Also, "Martha Helme Miller's Notebook."

11. A trysail is a small sail used to keep a vessel headed into the wind in a storm. Rope is sewn along its edge to prevent tearing. A trysail is blown "out of the rope" when the wind is so strong that the rope is ripped from the sail's fabric.

12. Nathaniel Tuthill, "Journal of Voyage from Nevis to North Carolina," 23 February 1820-4 May 1820, Log Book Convoy folder, Log Books Whaling Shipping box, Suffolk County Historical Society, Riverhead, N.Y.

2002 Winner:
Family History Writing Contest

**Using Uncommon Sources to Illuminate
Family History:
A Long Island Tuthill Example**

By Willis H. White, CG

Persistent and creative searching can lead to repositories that genealogists rarely investigate. The result can be a bounty of unusual documentary sources containing much greater detail than can be gleaned from commonly used genealogical records.

Serious family historians strive to portray their ancestors fully and to place them in historical, social, and cultural contexts. Ironically, vital records, censuses, and other records that genealogists most often use provide only skeletal biographical details. Less-used manuscript and published materials, however, may substantially enrich the researcher's understanding and re-creation of ancestral lives, especially when ancestors—or their relatives or associates—wrote the material and the sources preserve their own thoughts and words.

Discovering such sources can be challenging. Housed in repositories that genealogists rarely utilize and neither microfilmed nor digitized, such materials typically involve on-site research. Locating them requires unfamiliar finding aids. When underused sources are unearthed, however, their descriptiveness compensates for the difficulty in locating them.

The following Tuthill family history draws heavily on unusual sources, including school publications, sermons, ships' logs, speeches, and even an oath—materials located in local historical societies and archives, schools, and the private collections of Tuthill collateral relatives. The resulting narrative demonstrates how brightly an array of uncommon sources can illuminate an ancestral family's lives, characteristics, and successes.¹

© Willis H. White, CG; 12779 Flat Meadow Lane; Herndon, VA 20171. Mr. White is a family history writer and newsletter editor. He specializes in Long Island, New York, and New England.

1. All locations in the narrative are in N.Y., unless specified otherwise.

On an 1824 voyage, Nathaniel offered this humble prayer, "I wish it might be my lot to be com beter than I am. be more Enlightened in true Religion. . . . God grant it may be the case with me and my tender family Amen."¹³ Not long thereafter, Nathaniel left the "boystrus sea,"¹⁴ joined the Wading River Congregational Church, and began dealing in land and timber and building sailing vessels.¹⁵ One of Wading River's "most active, beloved and valued citizens," he served as overseer of highways, school trustee, church deacon, and parish trustee.¹⁶

In 1837, Nathaniel left Wading River for Greenport, about thirty miles east. With no harbor, Wading River was not a favorable place to build vessels.¹⁷ Greenport, on the other hand, was an active deep-water port.¹⁸ Nathaniel reported, "We made out very well in moving, that is [we] got all things safe . . . now times are dull here at presant. One of the ships has arrived, but no sale for [whale] oil—the others is expected soon."¹⁹

Nathaniel set up his shipyard and commenced to build. Although barely ten years old, the town prospered: "The bay has not been entirely frozen over yet. 11 vessels lay within a few rods of this place and more than 14 at the large wharf. 5 whaling vessels belong to Green Port."²⁰ Nathaniel had work: "I have been quite busy this winter on a Sloop which I am building which I expect to get off in April."²¹

In spite of their economic success in Greenport, the Tuthills were not satisfied. Clarissa reported, "A female prayer meeting is stately held at this house on tuesday afternoon but very few take any interest in it and our number is very small."²² Nathaniel agreed, "Tryals and offences, Selfish and hardhartedness are

13. Nathaniel Tuthill, "Journal of a Voyage Sloop Favourite," 22 October 1822–11 April 1824, Journal Sloop Favourite folder, Log Books Whaling Shipping box.

14. Nathaniel Tuthill, "Journal of Voyage from Nevis to North Carolina."

15. "Parish of Wading River: Accounts and Meeting Minutes 1802–1911," Wading River Congregational Church, Wading River, N.Y.; Suffolk County Clerk, Deed Book E: 278, Historical Documents Library, Suffolk County Government Center, Riverhead, N.Y.; Timber sale agreement, 1831, Tuthill business folder, archive box "Business L-Z," Suffolk County Historical Society; and William S. Pelletreau, "Ellsworth Tuthill," in *A History of Long Island* (New York: Lewis Publishing Co., 1903), 3:267.

16. Benjamin K. Payne, "The Hon. James H. Tuthill, An Address Delivered Before the Suffolk County Historical Society, February 20, 1894, by Benjamin K. Payne, Esq.," in *In Memoriam—The Hon. James H. Tuthill* (Riverhead, N.Y.: Suffolk County Historical Society, 1894), 38–39; Arthur Channing Downs, ed., *Riverhead Town Records 1792–1886* (Huntington, N.Y.: Town of Riverhead, 1967), 335; Lapham, *Echoes From the Past*, 16–17; and "Records of the Congregational Church in Wading River, L.I. 1901–1928," Wading River Congregational Church.

17. Lapham, *Echoes From the Past*, 40.

18. Elsie Knapp Corwin, *Greenport, Yesterday and Today and the Diary of a Country Newspaper* (Greenport, N.Y.: The Suffolk Times, 1972), 165–71.

19. Letter, Nathaniel Tuthill to Charles Miller, 3 May 1837. All letters cited herein are original documents held by the author, a collateral relative of the Tuthills. The original recipients are the author's ancestors and cousins to the Tuthills.

20. Letter, James Tuthill to Edwin Miller, 16 February 1838.

21. Letter, Nathaniel Tuthill to Charles Miller, 23 March 1849.

22. Letter, Clarissa Tuthill to Corinna Miller, 2 June 1838.

flocking in. The pure love of God does not show it selfe in the Church yet I trust in my God and hope all things will work together for good."²³

About 1850, Nathaniel sold out to Hiram Bishop, a well-known ship builder. Nathaniel had gone "to settle with Mr. Bishop" on 12 May 1852 when he was stricken. He died the next morning.²⁴

Both Nathaniel and Clarissa Tuthill, well schooled in the Bible and its moral principles, faced early character-forming experiences. Nathaniel's position as a captain of sailing vessels taught him resourcefulness and self-discipline. Clarissa's loss of parents at the age of four and her childhood in her grandmother's household taught her self-reliance and responsibility. Certainly these qualities affected the personalities of their children.

Aside from character, the outstanding gift that Nathaniel and Clarissa conveyed to their children was their belief in the value of higher education. Though an awkward speller himself, Nathaniel sacrificed to educate his children. As a contemporary observed, "Captain Tuthill did so much for the education of his family that wonder was sometimes expressed by his neighbors at the extent of his resources. . . ."²⁵

Children of Nathaniel⁷ Tuthill and Clarissa Miller, all born probably at Wading River, were as follows:

- 2 i. EDMUND⁸ TUTHILL, born 1 December 1816, died 31 January 1817, probably at Wading River.²⁶
- + 3 ii. GEORGE MILLER TUTHILL, born 31 October 1818; married Anna Haines Hall;²⁷ died 9 May 1883, Kalamazoo, Michigan.²⁸
- 4 iii. [—?—] TUTHILL, a daughter who died in infancy.²⁹
- + 5 iv. FRANKLIN TUTHILL, born 3 April 1822;³⁰ married Emma H. Horton;³¹ died 27 August 1865, Brooklyn.³²
- 6 v. CHARLES TUTHILL, born 11 April 1824;³³ died, unmarried, 22 August 1847 of typhoid fever, Greenport.³⁴ Charles was a mariner.³⁵

23. Letter, Nathaniel Tuthill to Charles Miller, 15 August 1848.

24. Letter, Ellsworth Tuthill to James Tuthill, 13 May 1852.

25. Payne, "The Hon. James H. Tuthill," 38–39.

26. Nathaniel Tuthill Family Bible.

27. *Ibid.*

28. "The Late George M. Tuthill" undated clipping from unidentified newspaper, probably 1883, Kalamazoo, Mich.; included in "George M. Tuthill Diaries."

29. Primary information does not document this child, but she is noted in two derivative sources that appear to have relied on information from the family: Gwen Campbell, ed., *Descendants of Henry Tuthill 1612–1650* (Keno, Oreg.: Solo Press, 1991), 199; and Grace Loring Marsh, compiler, "The Miller Genealogy" (typescript), Suffolk County Historical Society, 15.

30. Nathaniel Tuthill Family Bible.

31. Albert G. Overton, transcriber, *Records of the First Church of Southold* (Shippensburg, Pa.: Overton Publications, 1984), 54.

32. Nathaniel Tuthill Family Bible.

33. *Ibid.*

34. "George M. Tuthill Diaries," 1: 32.

35. *Ibid.*, 1: 33–34.

- + 7 vi. JAMES HARVEY TUTHILL, born 19 February 1826;³⁶ married Maria Frances Foster;³⁷ died 18 January 1894, Riverhead, Town of Riverhead, Suffolk County.³⁸
- + 8 vii. ELLSWORTH TUTHILL, born 13 April 1828;³⁹ married Helen Hudson;⁴⁰ died 10 April 1911, Mattituck, Town of Southold, Suffolk County.⁴¹
- + 9 viii. SARAH STRONG TUTHILL, born 27 August 1830;⁴² died, unmarried, 4 March 1882, Brooklyn.⁴³

Generation Two

3. **George Miller⁸ Tuthill** (Nathaniel⁷), born 31 October 1818 at Wading River;⁴⁴ died 9 May 1883 at Kalamazoo, Michigan.⁴⁵ He married 12 May 1847, **Anna Haines Hall**, daughter of William and Mary (née Haines) Hall.⁴⁶ Anna was born 21 December 1825; died 11 March 1913 at Chicago, Illinois.⁴⁷

*Children . . . must have learned more indirectly than directly. Detained six hours of each day, reading, writing and doing nothing, there . . . was created a vacuum within their brains, so that when let loose [from school], intelligence rushed in to fill it.*⁴⁸

Such was one scholar's opinion of his late 1820s education in the common school at Wading River. Though school buildings were primitive, books scarce, and teachers ill-trained, he admitted that students "learned to obey," "herd peacefully with their fellows," multiply, spell, and "point the feather end of the quill over the right shoulder."⁴⁹ George Tuthill had attended such a "district" or "common" elementary school but could go no further until academies filled the gap. Throughout Long Island, local citizens formed stock companies, contributed funds, appointed trustees, erected buildings, and hired teachers for secondary

36. Nathaniel Tuthill Family Bible.

37. *Ibid.*

38. "Riverhead Cemetery Inscriptions," Vertical file, Riverhead folder, Cemetery file, Suffolk County Historical Society.

39. Nathaniel Tuthill Family Bible.

40. "George M. Tuthill Diaries," 3: 406.

41. "Diary of Samuel H. Miller," entry of 10 April 1911; in possession of the author.

42. Nathaniel Tuthill Family Bible.

43. "George M. Tuthill Diaries," 12: 187.

44. Nathaniel Tuthill Family Bible.

45. "The Late George M. Tuthill."

46. Nathaniel Tuthill Family Bible; and "George M. Tuthill Diaries," 2: 161.

47. Anna Hall Tuthill obituary, *Chicago Tribune*, 12 March 1913, p. 3, column 5; and Anna Hall Tuthill death certificate no. 7635 (1913), Cook County Clerk, Chicago, Ill. Informant on the certificate was Anna's daughter, Julia Tuthill Moore, with whom Anna lived the last twelve years of her life.

48. Franklin Tuthill, *The Old Schools and the New—An Address Delivered at the Closing Exercises of the Twenty-Ninth Term of the New York State Normal School February 3, 1859* (Albany: James Cruikshank, 1859), 11.

49. *Ibid.*

school academies.⁵⁰ When Franklinville Academy opened in 1833, George, age fifteen, was among its students.⁵¹

George supported a temperance group at the academy. He also started an "Anti-Tobacco Society," in which subscribers, "believing that the habitual use of tobacco is not only useless but injurious," pledged not to "use the same in chewing, smoking, or snuffing."⁵²

For his profession, George chose the ministry. At sixteen, he made his ninety-three-year-old grandmother feel she could "depart in peace,"⁵³ by announcing he had "found Jesus."⁵⁴ He advised a cousin not to "be afraid to speak with the impenitent on the subject of their souls^l salvation."⁵⁵

After graduating from Amherst College in 1839, George taught one year at a "private school in Pennsylvania" and two years at Miller Place Academy before entering Union Theological Seminary in New York City.⁵⁶ He took on his task with a burst of idealism: "In the midst of this great city . . . stands a Seminary—where are collected some scores of young men who are to be teachers of the people of God . . . the leaders of the hosts of the Lord."⁵⁷ Upon graduating in 1846 and receiving his license to preach, George contemplated his next step: "I look upon my future life as not one of ease or amusement—but of hard work. . . . The cry is from abroad—from India—China—and West. . . . I hope I shall not be allowed to stop up my ears . . . from hearing the call and going where it bids."⁵⁸

The West "called." George enthusiastically began starting new congregations and stimulating old ones. He organized the Spruce Street Church in St. Louis, led six additional churches in Illinois, Ohio, and Michigan, and closed his career in Kalamazoo as superintendent for the Michigan-Wisconsin district of the American Bible Society.⁵⁹ Rarely, George managed a trip to Long Island, where the entire family "all collected in a knot, and sung the songs of Zion."⁶⁰

Facing countless difficulties, George was optimistic. Farmers and ministers, he asserted, "generally have hard times at first but if patience lasts, they both have

50. "Old Academies Played Important Part In The Education of Our Youth," *Long Island Traveler*, Southold, N.Y., 16 May 1846.

51. *Catalogue of the Students, Instructors and Trustees of Franklinville Academy for the Term Ending April 4, 1834* (Sag Harbor, N.Y.: Franklinville Academy, 1834).

52. Letter, George Tuthill to Edwin Miller, 3 July 1835.

53. Letter, Charles Miller to Edwin Miller, 21 February 1834.

54. Letter, Nathaniel Tuthill to Charles Miller, 21 February 1834.

55. Letter, George Tuthill to Edwin Miller, 23 December 1835.

56. Robert S. Fletcher and Malcolm O. Young, eds., *Amherst College Biographical Record of the Graduates and Non-Graduates, Centennial Edition (1821–1921)* (Amherst, Mass.: The College, 1927), 93; and "The Late George M. Tuthill." Also, "Millers Place Academy Records," 1834–1868; in possession of Margaret Davis Gass, Miller Place, N.Y.

57. Letter, George Tuthill to Edwin Miller, 11 October 1843.

58. Letter, George Tuthill to Edwin Miller, 12 April 1845.

59. "The Late George M. Tuthill."

60. "George M. Tuthill Diaries," 2: 267.

brighter prospects.”⁶¹ According to his mother, George always believed that the Lord would “yet bless his labors.”⁶²

George stayed the longest—seven years—at the Congregational Church of St. Clair, Michigan. Impressed by his 1851 Thanksgiving sermon, the congregation published it.⁶³ Twenty-five years after George left St. Clair, they remembered his “faithful ministrations.”⁶⁴

George was an issues-oriented preacher. According to a pastor-colleague, he kept “well informed and abreast with the age.”⁶⁵ He addressed the day-to-day spiritual needs of his congregation but also maintained long-held convictions. He applauded the “triumph of temperance in Maine, in passing and enforcing a law which prohibits . . . alcoholic liquors.” Similarly, George vociferously attacked slavery for “laying foul hands upon men and women for whom there is no better claim than that their ancestors were seized on the coast of Africa by piratical slave-traders.” He extolled efforts to “raise Hungary to be the bulwark of a pure Christianity” and cheered the “rapid extension of the gospel that giveth life” throughout the world.⁶⁶

Although retired in Kalamazoo, George remained “an enthusiastic lover of dear old Long Island.” Until his death, he retained “deep abiding Christian faith.”⁶⁷

Children of George Miller⁸ Tuthill and Anna Haines Hall were as follows:

- 10 i. FRANK HALL⁹ TUTHILL, born 7 June 1849, St. Louis, Missouri;⁶⁸ married Isabella Heath Hall,⁶⁹ Mary Emma Holt,⁷⁰ and Jessie Evelyn Sherman;⁷¹ died 24 February 1936, Evanston, Illinois.⁷²
- 11 ii. MARY HAINES TUTHILL, born 5 November 1851, St. Clair, Michigan;⁷³ married Wesley Galileo Bailey;⁷⁴ died 25 March 1913, Olalla, Washington.⁷⁵

61. Letter, George Tuthill to Charles Miller, 18 September 1848.

62. Letter, Clarissa Tuthill to Charles Miller, 22 March 1849.

63. George M. Tuthill, *Thanksgiving for 1851, A Sermon* (St. Clair, Mich.: A.M. Tenney, 1851).

64. Testimony to George M. Tuthill, *St. Clair Republican*, St. Clair, Mich., 23 May 1883.

65. “The Late George M. Tuthill.”

66. Tuthill, *Thanksgiving for 1851, A Sermon*, 12–14.

67. “The Late George M. Tuthill;” and Letter, George Tuthill to Tuthill Kindred, 20 August 1867, in *A Family Meeting of the Descendants of John Tuthill* (Sag Harbor, N.Y.: Express Print, 1867), 39–40.

68. “George M. Tuthill Diaries,” 2: 166.

69. Tuthill-Hall marriage announcement, *Chicago Tribune*, 7 October 1885, p. 8, column 5.

70. Albert N. Marquis, comp. and ed., *Who's Who in Chicago and Vicinity, the Book of Chicagoans* (Chicago: A.N. Marquis Company, 1931), 991; and Frank H. Tuthill household, 1900 U.S. census, Cook County, Ill., population schedule, town of Lake, enumeration dist. [ED] 948, sheet 352, dwelling 24, family 46; National Archives (NA) microfilm publication T623, roll 283.

71. Frank H. Tuthill, death certificate no. 128 (1936), Cook County Clerk, Chicago, Ill.

72. *Ibid.*

73. “George M. Tuthill Diaries,” 2: 342.

74. Bailey-Tuthill marriage license no. 120320 (1887), Illinois Regional Archives, Ronald Williams Library, Northeastern Illinois University, Chicago.

75. Mary Tuthill Bailey, death certificate no. 3798 (1913), Washington State Board of Health, Olympia.

- 12 iii. WILLIAM HALL TUTHILL, born 23 November 1853, St. Clair;⁷⁶ married Ellen Hale Latimer⁷⁷ and Charlotte Beulah Logan;⁷⁸ died 31 March 1932, Chicago.⁷⁹
- 13 iv. JULIA ST. CLAIR TUTHILL, born 8 May 1857, St. Clair;⁸⁰ married James Hills Moore;⁸¹ died 9 October 1951, Greensville, Virginia.⁸²

5. Franklin⁸ Tuthill (Nathaniel⁷) was born 3 April 1822 at Wading River; died 27 August 1865 at Brooklyn.⁸³ He married on 7 July 1847 at Southold, Emma Harriet Horton,⁸⁴ daughter of Salter and Harriet (née Case) Horton.⁸⁵ Emma was born about 1828;⁸⁶ died 5 September 1892 at Southold.⁸⁷

Franklin Tuthill entered Franklinville Academy in 1833. A scholar who translated Greek and Latin freely, he advised a cousin, "You say Latin comes to you pretty hard yet. So it did to me but 'patience and perserverance will overcome all difficulties.'"⁸⁸ Even at thirteen, Franklin enjoyed writing: "My pen is very poor but I cannot stop to mend it. If you could only cast but one look at the ill-shaped pen I hold in my hand, could you behold my trembling hand and my unsnuffed candle, could you hear the clock now striking eleven you would certainly excuse me."⁸⁹

Franklin appeared undistinguished. George described his brother as "little pale, emaciated Franklin . . . I wish he might have a little more redness of countenance."⁹⁰ Franklin himself wrote, "My respects to Mr. Smith although he is tall and I am small."⁹¹

Franklin graduated from Franklinville Academy in 1836,⁹² Amherst College in 1840,⁹³ and the medical department of the University of the City of New York

76. "George M. Tuthill Diaries," 3: 467.

77. Tuthill-Latimer marriage license no. 311364 (1900), Cook County, Ill.; microfilm 1,030,311, Family History Library (FHL), Salt Lake City, Utah.

78. Tuthill-Logan marriage license no. 434342 (1906), Cook County, Ill.; FHL microfilm 1,030,403.

79. William H. Tuthill, death certificate no. 9387 (1932), Illinois Department of Health, Springfield; FHL microfilm 1,893,250.

80. "George M. Tuthill Diaries," 4: 791.

81. Moore-Tuthill marriage license no. 102655 (1890), Illinois Regional Archives, Ronald Williams Library.

82. Julia Tuthill Moore obituary, *The Chicago Tribune*, 10 October 1951, part 4, p. 6, column 2.

83. Nathaniel Tuthill Family Bible; and "George M. Tuthill Diaries" 7 (unpaginated): entry of 30 August 1865.

84. Albert G. Overton, *Records of the First Church of Southold*, 54.

85. Fletcher and Young, eds., *Amherst College Biographical Record*, 100.

86. Calculated from age at marriage. "Births, Marriages and Deaths, Suffolk County, Long Island, N.Y., 1847-1849," *Suffolk County Historical Society Register* 22 (Summer 1996): 122.

87. Emma H. Tuthill death notice, *The Long Island Traveler*, Southold, N.Y., 9 September 1892, p. 3, column 6.

88. Letter, Franklin Tuthill to Edwin Miller, 12 July 1836.

89. *Ibid.*

90. Letter, George Tuthill to Charles Miller, 23 January 1837.

91. Letter, Franklin Tuthill to Edwin Miller, 12 July 1836.

92. Letter, Franklin Tuthill to Edwin Miller, 12 July 1836; and Franklin Tuthill obituary, *New York Times*, 28 August 1865, p. 5, column 1.

93. Fletcher and Young, eds., *Amherst College Biographical Record*, 100.

in 1844.⁹⁴ His brother observed that Franklin “is now an M.D.—two letters that have demanded 3 yrs close study.”⁹⁵

At twenty-two, Franklin began his medical practice in Southold with difficulty. Folks did not trust their health to a young physician. Franklin devised a plan. Appear older. Comb hair so that the few white strands are “sure to be observed.” Cultivate facial wrinkles for “with age alone the people think that there is wisdom.” Tread gently, “as if the sick were always present.” Appear competent. Buy a “mountain of books” and “be sure that none of them be left in secluded parts” of the house. Pore over books so that people can see that you are studious. Be seen writing so that you gain “credit at once for an intelligent student.” Attract attention. “Make your name ring in the town” so that “there shall be none so ignorant as will confess they have not heard it.” “Invent a theory, or re-hash an old one.” “Hire some rowdy to black your eye, and tell the story to a reporter.”⁹⁶

Franklin’s efforts probably succeeded. He later advised that a young doctor’s “genuine worth will soon make him a reputation, and the confidence of the people will come faster than his confidence in himself.”⁹⁷ People liked him. At various times he was superintendent of common schools, postmaster, and a representative to the New York State Assembly for Suffolk County.⁹⁸

After only seven years in Southold, Franklin moved his practice to Brooklyn in 1851.⁹⁹ The same year Henry J. Raymond founded the *New York Times*.¹⁰⁰ The two men’s careers intertwined. Raymond remembered, “Soon after the Times started he [Franklin] began to write for its columns, manifesting such marked ability and originality, that he was invited to abandon medicine and embrace journalism as a profession, which he did.”¹⁰¹ Franklin became one of the first associate editors of the *Times*.¹⁰²

A popular speaker, Franklin gave commencement addresses at the New York Medical College and the New York Normal School.¹⁰³ In 1858, he again served a term in the New York State Assembly, this time for the City of Brooklyn. Franklin was a successful legislator, for he “never failed to laugh his

94. Letter, George Tuthill to Edwin Miller, 14 March 1844.

95. Ibid.

96. Franklin Tuthill, *First Years of Practice: An Address to the Graduating Class of the New York Medical College, March 1854* (New York: Edward P. Allen, 1855).

97. Ibid.

98. “Oath by Franklin Tuthill, Superintendent of Common Schools, 1846,” document 7.11.4, file folder 7.11, Documents: Southold Town Papers, Southold Historical Society; “List of Post Masters Southold Post Office 1802–1936,” file folder FC 1.2.69, Post Offices, Southold Historical Society; and Edwin G. Burrows and Mike Wallace, *Gotham—A History of New York City to 1898* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1999), 679.

99. Franklin Tuthill obituary, 28 August 1865.

100. Burrows and Wallace, *Gotham—A History of New York City to 1898*, 679.

101. Franklin Tuthill obituary, 28 August 1865.

102. Augustus Maverick, *Henry J. Raymond and the New York Press* (Hartford: A. S. Hale and Company, 1870), 143.

103. Tuthill, *First Years of Practice*; and Tuthill, *The Old Schools and the New*.

opponent into good humor, even when he demolished his theories or projects."¹⁰⁴

Franklin left New York in 1859 to become editor of the *San Francisco Evening Bulletin*. He performed so well that his employers made him part owner.¹⁰⁵ As if that weren't enough, Franklin tackled writing a history of California from its discovery through the Civil War. He studied "log-books of ancient mariners," local government reports, Congressional papers, newspapers, and personal interviews to write a 644-page history that reads like a novel. Franklin's efforts produced California's first comprehensive history documenting dramatic changes that the 1849 gold rush stimulated.¹⁰⁶

The History of California was Franklin's swan song. Less than a week after writing its preface and reading its proof sheets, he died in Brooklyn, age forty-three.¹⁰⁷

Children of Franklin⁸ Tuthill and Emma Harriet Horton were as follows:

- 14 i. SARAH STRONG⁹ TUTHILL,¹⁰⁸ born 2 April 1848, Southold;¹⁰⁹ died 21 September 1849, Southold.¹¹⁰
- 15 ii. ANNA ELIZABETH TUTHILL,¹¹¹ born June 1855, New York state;¹¹² married William Redin Woodward;¹¹³ died 12 June 1906, Washington, D.C.¹¹⁴

7. **James Harvey⁸ Tuthill** (Nathaniel⁷), born 19 February 1826 at Wading River;¹¹⁵ died 18 January 1894 at Riverhead.¹¹⁶ He married 16 January 1850 at Riverhead, **Maria Frances Foster**,¹¹⁷ daughter of Herman D. and Betsey P. (née Woodhull) Foster.¹¹⁸ Maria was born 22 March 1829; died 1 August 1916 at Riverhead.¹¹⁹

Franklinville was not Long Island's only academy. Miller Place built one in

104. Franklin Tuthill obituary, 28 August 1865.

105. *Ibid.*

106. Franklin Tuthill, preface to *The History of California* (San Francisco: H. H. Bancroft, 1866), vii.

107. Franklin Tuthill obituary, 28 August 1865.

108. Sarah Strong Tuthill tombstone, Southold Presbyterian Church Cemetery, Southold, N.Y.

109. "Births, Marriages and Deaths, Suffolk County, Long Island, N.Y., 1847-1849," *Suffolk County Historical Society Register* 21 (Winter 1995): 88.

110. Sarah Strong Tuthill tombstone.

111. Anna E. Woodward obituary, 12 June 1906, clipping from unidentified newspaper, Nat S. Tuthill envelope, Tuthill folder, newspaper clippings vertical file, Cutchogue Free Library, Cutchogue, N.Y.

112. William G. Green household, 1900 U.S. census, Washington, D.C., pop. sch., ED 55, sheet 167, dwell. 73, fam. 79; NA microfilm T623, roll 160.

113. Woodward-Tuthill marriage announcement, *The Washington Post*, Washington, D.C., 23 September 1881, p. 4, column 6.

114. Anna Tuthill Woodward death notice, *The Evening Star*, Washington, D.C., 13 June 1906, p. 5, column 7.

115. Nathaniel Tuthill Family Bible.

116. "Riverhead Cemetery Inscriptions."

117. "Records of Rev. Charles J. Knowles," *Suffolk County Historical Society Register* 23 (Summer 1997): 24.

118. Maria Tuthill obituary, clipping from unidentified newspaper, Nat S. Tuthill envelope.

119. "Riverhead Cemetery Inscriptions." Birth date given on tombstone (not calculated).

1834.¹²⁰ George and Franklin Tuthill finished at Franklinville, but their younger brothers, James and Ellsworth, attended Miller Place Academy.

At age nine, James entered Miller Place in 1835¹²¹ amidst much family advice: “be a good boy both in school and out . . . be good to the little scholars around you[,] obey your teacher and try to learn as fast as you can;”¹²² “keep all compositions done up neatly together.”¹²³ James strived to go “to his seat with as little noise as possible,” to make “no interruption with his feet or any thing else,” and not to “bring in dirt on his shoes.”¹²⁴ With fellow students, he began studies by reading the Bible.¹²⁵

A critical teaching tool for academies was the “exhibition,” where scholars made public presentations. James performed in an unusual number of courtroom dramas—in 1840 as “The Village Lawyer”¹²⁶ and in 1842 as “Council for Defendant.”¹²⁷ Even at fourteen, he seemed destined for the legal profession.

James graduated from Williams College in 1846 at age twenty.¹²⁸ He studied law for three years under judges in Riverhead and New York. After gaining admission to the bar,¹²⁹ he formed a partnership and opened a law practice in Riverhead, seat of Suffolk County.¹³⁰

James made phenomenal contributions to his profession, church, and community. He served six years as district attorney and twelve as surrogate court judge. He thoroughly reorganized the surrogate’s office, making “valuable papers, including accountings, inventories and proofs of wills, . . . accessible to lawyers.” “Sustained by the higher courts,” his judgments “in all appeals on will decisions” were sound.¹³¹

As superintendent of the Sunday school of the Riverhead Congregational Church for forty-five years, James became the first president of the Suffolk

120. Margaret Davis Gass, *A History of the Miller’s Place Academy* (Miller Place, N.Y.: Miller’s Place Academy, 1997), 4.

121. “Millers Place Academy Records.”

122. Letter, Clarissa Tuthill to James Tuthill, 11 July 1835.

123. Letter, George Tuthill to James Tuthill, 4 July 1835.

124. Edwin Miller, “Description of a good student,” 15 December 1835, collection of one-page compositions by Edwin Miller, 1834–41; in possession of author.

125. Edwin Miller, “A Brief Account of a Day’s Occupation,” 20 February 1839, *Ibid*.

126. “Miller Place Academy, Order of Exercises for Exhibition, Friday, September 25, 1840,” in Gass, *A History of the Miller’s Place Academy*, 15.

127. *Miller Place Academy, Order of Exercises for Exhibition, Friday, Sept. 30th, 1842* (n.p.: Miller Place Academy, 1842).

128. *Catalogue of the Officers and Students of Williams College 1845–46* (Troy, N.Y.: J. C. Kneeland and Co., 1845).

129. William I. Chalmers, “In Memoriam, The Hon. James H. Tuthill, An Address Delivered at the Funeral of the Hon. James H. Tuthill, in the Congregational Church, Riverhead, N.Y., by the Reverend William I. Chalmers, January 21st, 1894,” in *In Memoriam—The Hon. James H. Tuthill*, 22.

130. Epher Whitaker, “The Hon. James H. Tuthill, An Address Delivered in Riverhead, February 20, 1894, at the Annual Meeting of the Suffolk County Historical Society, by the Rev. Epher Whitaker, D.D., the First Vice-President of the Society,” in *In Memoriam—The Hon. James H. Tuthill*, 27–28.

131. “Twelve Years’ Work in the Surrogate’s Office,” unidentified newspaper, 1 January 1892, Newspaper clipping vertical file (Lizzie Horton clippings), Tuthill folder.

County Sunday-school Association.¹³² He energized the Chautauqua Literary Society of Riverhead,¹³³ led organization of the Riverhead Village Library Association,¹³⁴ and presided over the Suffolk County Historical Society.¹³⁵ He also worked as town superintendent of schools,¹³⁶ trustee of the Riverhead Savings Bank¹³⁷ and director of the Suffolk County National Bank.¹³⁸

James served two terms in the New York State Assembly. In 1861, he promoted "the enactment of such laws as were necessary . . . to crush the rebellion and save the imperiled life of the Nation."¹³⁹

James's 1894 death caused an unsurpassed outpouring of "public esteem and affection." Thirteen eulogies, testimonials, and resolutions fill a forty-seven-page volume.¹⁴⁰

The only child of James Harvey⁸ Tuthill and Maria Frances Foster was

- 16 i. RUTH HALSEY⁹ TUTHILL,¹⁴¹ born 2 April 1851,¹⁴² Riverhead; died there, unmarried, 23 October 1917.¹⁴³

8. Ellsworth⁸ Tuthill (Nathaniel⁷), born 13 April 1828 at Wading River;¹⁴⁴ died 10 April 1911 at Mattituck.¹⁴⁵ He married 15 September 1852 at Wading River, Helen Hudson.¹⁴⁶ She was born 17 December 1833, probably at Wading River; died 18 May 1901.¹⁴⁷

When Ellsworth, the youngest Tuthill brother, attended 1846 and 1847 sessions at Miller Place Academy, he already had a profession—sailing in the coastal trade like his father.¹⁴⁸ Concerning a sloop he was building, his father wrote, "I shall let Ellsworth take her if I do not sell₁; if I should sell E. will go in some other vessel."¹⁴⁹

132. Chalmers, "In Memoriam," 20.

133. "Resolutions Adopted by the Chautauqua Literary Society, Riverhead, N.Y.," in *In Memoriam—The Hon. James H. Tuthill*, 12.

134. Chalmers, "In Memoriam," 21.

135. "Action of the Suffolk County Historical Society," in *In Memoriam—The Hon. James H. Tuthill*, 4.

136. Chalmers, "In Memoriam," 21.

137. "Resolutions Adopted by the Riverhead Savings Bank," in *In Memoriam—The Hon. James H. Tuthill*, 10.

138. "Minute Adopted by the Suffolk County National Bank, Riverhead, N.Y.," in *In Memoriam—The Hon. James H. Tuthill*, 11.

139. Whitaker, "The Hon. James H. Tuthill," 29.

140. "Minute adopted by the Suffolk County National Bank," 11.

141. "Riverhead Cemetery Inscriptions."

142. Entry of 2 April 1855, "Diary of James H. Tuthill," Long Island Collection, East Hampton Library, East Hampton, N.Y. The entry states, "Ruty's [sic] birthday—4 yrs old."

143. Ruth H. Tuthill obituary, *Riverhead News*, Riverhead, N.Y., 26 October 1917, p. 2, column 3.

144. Nathaniel Tuthill Family Bible.

145. "Diary of Samuel H. Miller," entry of 10 April 1911.

146. "George M. Tuthill Diaries," 3: 406.

147. Helen Tuthill tombstone, cemetery at Mattituck Presbyterian Church, Mattituck, N.Y. Birth date on tombstone (not calculated). Birthplace implied by "George Miller Diaries," 3: 406.

148. "Millers Place Academy Records;" and William S. Pelletreau, "Ellsworth Tuthill," in *A History of Long Island*, 3: 267.

149. Letter, Nathaniel Tuthill to Charles Miller, 23 March 1849.

Ellsworth eventually tried other professions. As a farmer, he specialized in livestock. In 1872, with his son Nathaniel, he began a retail butcher business.¹⁵⁰ It was hazardous: "Capt. Ellsworth Tuthill was going down the hill by the mill, the horses before his meat wagon became frightened by the wagon hitting their heels. They ran to the mill bridge and turning suddenly, horses, wagon, driver and all went off the bridge into the mill pond." All survived, except the contents of the wagon, which stayed in the pond.¹⁵¹

Ellsworth commenced a third career—fishing.¹⁵² Around 1790, Long Island farmers discovered that menhaden—a type of herring—made excellent fertilizer. Farmers spread the boiled, de-oiled, and dried fish on their fields. By the 1850s other uses emerged—fish oil was used in paint, cosmetics, and leather tanning.¹⁵³

In the 1870s menhaden fishing was becoming a big business. The invention of a net that could be closed with a drawstring enabled fishing from vessels rather than trapping fish near the shore. Steam-powered craft permitted better access to fish and prompt delivery of cargo.¹⁵⁴

Seeing the opportunity, Ellsworth, his brother James, and son Nathaniel established a prosperous menhaden factory.¹⁵⁵ Consequently, about 1900, Nathaniel was able to expand Ellsworth's farmhouse into a five-story Victorian mansion with twenty-three rooms that survives to this day.¹⁵⁶

The only child of Ellsworth⁸ Tuthill and Helen Hudson was

- 17 i. NATHANIEL STRONG⁹ TUTHILL,¹⁵⁷ born 24 August 1853,¹⁵⁸ Wading River;¹⁵⁹ married Suzie J. Hawkins¹⁶⁰ and Anna R. Gildersleeve;¹⁶¹ died 15 January 1939, Mattituck.¹⁶²

9. Sarah Strong⁸ Tuthill (Nathaniel⁷), born 27 August 1830 at Wading River;¹⁶³ died 4 March 1882, at Brooklyn; unmarried.¹⁶⁴

150. "Nathaniel S. Tuthill obituary," unidentified newspaper, 15 January 1939, Newspaper clipping vertical file (Lizzie Horton clippings).

151. *Suffolk Times*, Greenport, N.Y., 4 August 1877, p. 3, column 3.

152. Pelletreau, *A History of Long Island*, 3: 267.

153. Jeffrey Kassner, "Long Island and the Menhaden," *Long Island Forum* 47 (November 1984): 212–17.

154. *Ibid.*

155. Pelletreau, *A History of Long Island*, 3: 267.

156. "Capt. Ellsworth Tuthill/Semmer House—MK-38," *Building-Structure Inventory Form*, Southold Town Landmarks Preservation Commission, Southold, N.Y., 1985.

157. Ellsworth Tuthill household, 1910 U.S. census, Suffolk County, N.Y., pop. sch., town of Southold, ED 1402, sheet 1 (p. 299), dwell. 15, fam. 16; NA microfilm T624, roll 1082.

158. Nathaniel S. Tuthill tombstone, cemetery at Mattituck Presbyterian Church, Mattituck, N.Y. Birth date given on tombstone (not calculated).

159. Nathaniel S. Tuthill obituary, clipping from unidentified newspaper, Nat S. Tuthill envelope.

160. Tuthill-Hawkins marriage notice, *Suffolk Times*, Greenport, N.Y., 24 November 1877, p. 3, column 4.

161. Tuthill-Gildersleeve marriage notice, *Riverhead News*, Riverhead, N.Y., 15 November 1902, p. 2, column 4.

162. Nathaniel S. Tuthill obituary, *New York Times*, 17 January 1939, p. 21, column 4.

163. Nathaniel Tuthill Family Bible.

164. "George M. Tuthill Diaries," 12: 187.

Though Sarah did not attend an academy like her brothers, she learned well. She entered Mount Holyoke College in 1846 and graduated as an art teacher in 1850.¹⁶⁵

Sarah moved several times during the 1850s, teaching various subjects at schools in Chicago and Bridgeport, Connecticut. For a time, she cared for her aged mother in Greenport. Teaching at an Alabama women's college when the Civil War began, Sarah left the South just before the first battle of Bull Run.¹⁶⁶

In 1863 Sarah began the core of her career—fourteen years at Miss Porter's School in Farmington, Connecticut. She wrote, "The school is much superior to any I have ever been connected with. It is an old school and has a wide reputation and the pupils seem all to be from families of wealth."¹⁶⁷

An accomplished artist, Sarah strove to record natural objects as they truly were. Still lifes, especially birds, were her specialty. She displayed her work at national exhibitions and achieved renown as a practitioner of the "Pre-Raphaelite" art style.¹⁶⁸

Sarah left Miss Porter's School in 1877 to perfect her technique in Paris but returned ill three years later. She died of cancer in Brooklyn in 1882.¹⁶⁹

Nathaniel and Clarissa Tuthill's children were unique among their contemporaries. Of fifteen first cousins, only the Tuthills went to college. They demonstrated uncompromising commitment to education, unselfish dedication to community service, and good character. Nurturing by remarkable parents best explains George's sacrifice and commitment, Franklin's humor and scholarship, James's selfless community service, Ellsworth's determination and ingenuity, and Sarah's artistic accomplishments.

In many ways, however, Nathaniel and Clarissa Tuthill were unremarkable. Their daily work and lives were typical of hundreds of thousands of early nineteenth-century American ancestors. Letters inherited by collateral relatives inspired research on the couple and their offspring. Persistence led to repositories that genealogists rarely investigate, including local historical societies and school and university archives. The search yielded a bounty of unusual documentary sources that were not obviously genealogical. Many of those sources preserved the Tuthills' own words. The extent of detail is much greater than what could be gleaned from commonly used genealogical records. Weaving the material together produced a genealogical narrative with greatly enlightened understanding of the family's character, motives, and accomplishments.

165. *Thirteenth Annual Catalogue of the Mount Holyoke Female Seminary in South Hadley, Mass. 1849-1850* (Amherst, Mass.: J. S. & C. Adams, 1850), 5.

166. "George M. Tuthill Diaries," 12: 190.

167. Letter, Sarah Strong Tuthill to Charles Miller, November 1863.

168. William H. Gerds, "Through a Glass Brightly: The American Pre-Raphaelites and Their Still Lifes and Nature Studies," in Linda S. Ferber and William H. Gerds, *The New Path: Ruskin and the American Pre-Raphaelites* (Brooklyn: Brooklyn Museum, 1985), 39. (The author thanks Hildy Cummings for locating this reference.)

169. "George M. Tuthill Diaries," 12: 187.